Anthropological Analyses

Dr. Samantha Blatt¹ & Dr. Amy Michael²

¹Idaho State University, Anthropology Department
²University of New Hampshire, Anthropology Department
Discovery

• **August 1979**- Sheriff Earl Holden responds to call about a suspicious burlap sack with clothing found in Civil Defense Cave by artifact hunters
  
  • Human torso recovered in a burlap sack
  
  • Holden believed that the remains were of a gambler from 60 years prior based on the clothing
  
  • No other remains or artifacts found during a search in the cave with a metal detector
  
  • Coroner Ernest Sill reported the body was dismembered and believed the decedent died no more than 10 years ago due to presence of flesh and odor

Clothing- blue pin-striped shirt, knitted maroon sweater, black woolen pants with suspenders
ISU Involvement

- **1991**- limbs recovered from torso discovered in 1979
  - Systematic excavation by Idaho Museum of Natural History (IMNH) & ISU
- **1997** transferred to Anthropology (Terri Hall) from IMNH
  - Stored in secure lab ever since
- **1997-2007**- student reports (Florence Dickens) and K9 searches (Semper Vigilans)
- **2015**- “Head Hunt”
  - Drs. Kyra Stull and Christian Petersen- search & excavate cave with ISU students to find skull- not retrieved
  - Nick Holmer- Idaho Virtualization Lab (IVL) 3D scans of cave

Photos by Daria Van Dolsen, Post Register, 2015.
Biological Profile Developed

• 1979- Doug Ubelaker (Smithsonian Institute) in coordination with FBI conducts initial report and analysis before maceration
  • PMI- 6 mos.-10 yrs.

• 2017- Dr. Kate Reedy (ISU) submits bone sample for DNA extraction to University of Northern Texas
  • Entered into CODIS and NDIS
  • NamUs updated

• 2017-2018- Drs. Amy Michael and Samantha Blatt (ISU) reported biological profile to Detective John Clements (Clark County)

Anthropology Report

• PMI: Unknown
• Sex: Biological male
• Age: 25-45
• Hair: reddish/ brown
• Ancestry: White
  • Postcranial measurements
  • 94.9% probability, but used with caution due to lack of skull and femur (preferred elements)
• Stature: 5’5” – 6’1” in life
  • Limb bone measures
  • Again…the preferred bone, the femur, could not be assessed because of dismemberment
Trauma Assessment

• Likely postmortem dismemberment using multiple methods and tools

• Sharp and blunt force trauma evident on humeri and femora

• Sharp force trauma evident on 5th (possibly 6th) cervical vertebra

• No founded cause of death
Identification of the Victim is the Priority

• Multiple analyses by many anthropologists and students, but no progress made on identification of the decedent in the 40 years since recovery

Enter the DNA Doe Project…

• March 2019- Drs. Amy Michael and Samantha Blatt make contact with Anthony Redgrave, Lee Bingham Redgrave, Margaret Press, and Colleen Fitzpatrick of the DNA Doe Project (DDP) - a summary of the case is sent with permission

• May-July 2019- Submitted sample for DNA extraction to DNA Solutions → sequencing by Othram, Inc.
Acknowledgements

John Clements, Clark County Sheriff’s Office, Jared Cornelison, Hannah Dawson, Florence Dickens and K9’s Beretta and Ruger (Semper Vigilans), DNA Solutions, Federal Bureau of Investigation, Colleen Fitzpatrick, Sara Getz, Terri Hall, Susanne Henrickson, Earl Holden, Nicholas Holmer, Idaho Museum of Natural History, ISU Department of Anthropology and students, Glenda King, Gregory Magoon, Bart May, Othram Inc., Christian Petersen, Margaret Press, Shanda Putnam, Anthony Redgrave, Lee Bingham Redgrave, Katherine Reedy, Ernest Sill, Kyra Stull, Douglas Ubelaker

Family of the deceased
DNA Doe Project donors and volunteers!
Identification of Clark County John Doe as Joseph Henry Loveless via Forensic Genealogy
DNA Doe Project

Dr. Margaret Press
Co-Executive Director

Dr. Colleen Fitzpatrick
Co-Executive Director

Anthony Lukas Redgrave
Forensic Genealogy Team Lead
Acknowledgements

DNA testers who have uploaded and opted in to law enforcement matching:

Dr. Kate Reedy, Dr. Samantha Blatt, Dr. Amy Michael, Othram, Inc., Dr. Gregory Magoon of Aerodyne Research, Justin Loe at Full Genomes Corporation, DNA Solutions

GEDmatch

Family Tree DNA

Our Generous donors

The Dyer Family Foundation

Our volunteer genealogists

Sheriff Bart May of the Clark County Sheriff’s Office
Case Statistics

- 14 Volunteer Genealogists
- More than 2,000 hours of research over 15 weeks
- Approximately 250 DNA cousins’ family trees researched
- 31,730 individuals in trees
Timeline

9 May 2019 - ISU ships tibia to DNA Solutions for extraction

17 May 2019 - DNA Solutions reports 76.26ng of extract obtained

5 Jul 2019 - Sequencing competed by Othram, Inc

16 Jul 2019 - Bioinformatics completed by Dr. Gregory Magoon, Senior Research Engineer at Aerodyne Research, Inc., working in collaboration with Full Genomes Corporation

18 Jul 2019 - DNA Doe Project begins forensic genealogy research

28 Oct 2019 - Genealogy team concludes that Clark County John Doe is Joseph Henry Loveless; begins confirmatory research

5 Nov 2019 - DNA Doe Project gives the Clark County Sheriff’s Dept. the name of the candidate for identification

13 Dec 2019 - Identity confirmed via comparison with living grandchild
Joseph Henry Loveless
Joseph Henry Loveless

b. 3 Dec. 1870, Payson, Utah Territory, USA

Father
Joseph Jackson Loveless
b. 1 Jun 1831 Shawnertown, Fountain, Indiana, USA
d. 22 Jan 1883 Payson, Utah, Utah, USA

Mother
Sarah Jane Scriggins
b. 13 Aug 1839 Salem, Essex, Massachusetts, USA
d. 3 Oct 1926 Payson, Utah, Utah, USA
Identification of "Clark County John Doe"

Joseph Henry Loveless
B. 3 Dec 1870
Aliases
Charles Smith
Walter Curran
Walt Cairins

MATCH 1
185.7cM
1C3R

MATCH 2
207cM
1C3R

MATCH 5
1628.7cM
GRANDCHILD

MATCH 3
165cM
1C3R

MATCH 4
170cM
1C3R

© DNA Doe Project
Research Challenges

● Utah Pioneer ancestry (Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints)
  ○ Endogamy due to insular community
  ○ Half-relationships due to polygamy
  ○ Hundreds of first cousins can descend from a single grandparent

● Broad post-mortem interval and age estimate
  ○ Broad target birth and death dates for candidate
  ○ Several potential candidates in this range

● Multiple aliases
  ○ Joseph Henry Loveless, AKA:
    ■ Walter Cairins/Curran/Currans/Cairns/Garron/Curnans
    ■ Charles Smith
  ○ Additional research was needed to prove that Loveless and Cairins/Smith were the same person

● Outlaw status
  ○ Lack of official records
  ○ Lived in a tent on the outskirts of town in 1916
Y-DNA and X-DNA

October 2019 - Bioinformatician Dr. Gregory Magoon extracts Y-DNA markers and locates the Loveless surname; Volunteer genealogist Mark Wholihan traces John Doe to recent patrilineal ancestor

John Doe’s Y-DNA was a close match to several Loveless Y-DNA testers that list James Loveless and Linna Hughes as their oldest known patrilineal ancestors on the public Loveless Y-DNA results pages at Rootsweb.com and FamilyTreeDNA.com.

James Loveless and Linna Hughes had a great great grandson named Joseph Jackson Loveless who married Sarah Jane Scriggins (Joseph Henry Loveless’ parents). John Doe’s X-DNA matched several testers who were related to Sarah Jane Scriggins making her a maternal ancestor of John Doe.

Joseph Henry Loveless had both the Loveless Y-DNA as well as the Scriggins X-DNA, confirming the proposed candidate for identification.
Corroborative Research

- A headstone with no death date was located for Joseph Henry Loveless in the Loveless family plot in the Payson City Cemetery
- Upon contacting the cemetery, no interment record was found associated with the plot
- Family stories regarding Joseph Henry’s death were disproven by the team via original records and newspaper articles

DNA Confirmation

- No living relatives close enough to produce a CODIS match
  - CODIS produces a hit only with a parent, child, or full sibling
- Confirmatory DNA testing was conducted by Deputy Clements via direct-to-consumer autosomal DNA test of a living grandchild
- DNA Results analyzed by DNA Doe Project; 100% consistent with grandparent/grandchild relationship
Timeline of Joseph Henry Loveless

- Born 3 Dec 1870, Payson, UT
- 3 Oct 1899 (age 28) - Marriage to Harriett Jane Savage, Salt Lake City, UT
- 4 May 1904 (age 33) - Divorce granted to Harriett Savage on grounds of desertion and failure to support (one child), Salt Lake City, UT
- 25 Aug 1905 (age 34) - Marriage to Agnes Octavia Caldwell, Bear Lake County, ID
- 1906-1913 - 4 children born to Agnes and Henry
- 20 Mar 1914 (age 43) - Arrested for bootlegging, Burley, ID.
- 11 Dec 1914 (age 44) - Arrested again for bootlegging, Burley, ID; escapes jail and is wanted on several liquor violations
- 2 Mar 1916 (age 46) - “Walter Garron” escapes from custody after stopping a train and sawing through jail bars
Timeline of Joseph Henry Loveless

- 5 May 1916 (age 46) - Agnes Loveless is murdered with an axe by “Charles Smith”; whereabouts of Joseph Henry Loveless are unaccounted for.
- 11 May 1916 (age 46) - A man named “Walter Currans,” who also gives the alias “Smith,” is arrested for the murder of his “Common Law Wife” Agnes Loveless. She is also described as a suspected bootlegger, and used the alias “Ada Smith” in town.
- 23 May 1916 (age 46) - “Walter Cairins” escapes from jail by sawing through the bars using a saw he hid in his shoes. At Agnes’ funeral, one of Agnes and Henry’s children is quoted as saying “Papa never stayed in jail very long and he’ll soon be out.”
- Evidence clearly suggests that Walter Cairins, Charles Smith, and Joseph Henry Loveless are all the same person, and Agnes Loveless was murdered by her husband. This was later confirmed by the Clark County Sheriff’s Office via police records.
Agnes Octavia Caldwell Loveless
1880-1916
Walter Cairins, who formerly gave his name as Charles Smith, is being held at St. Anthony under a charge of having murdered his common-law wife at Dubois last Saturday. He told several stories, saying that he thought the woman’s former husband killed her. He said he was bound for the north for a supply of whiskey for his wife to dispose of in Dubois.
WANTED FOR MURDER!

Walt Cairns, age about 40 years, height about 5 ft. 8 or 9 in., weight about 165 pounds, dark brown hair, slightly gray around ears, eyes bluish brown, medium complexion, has little or no eyebrows, small scar over right eye, tattoo of star on right hand between thumb and index finger, also tattoo of anchor same place on left hand; he wore a light colored hat, brown coat, red sweater, blue overalls over black trousers.

Walt Cairns is supposed to have murdered Mrs. Agnes Loveless, with an axe, at Dubois, Idaho, night of May 5th, 1916. He was arrested and taken to St. Anthony, Idaho, where he sawed out of the county jail on the evening of May 18th, 1916.

Arrest, hold and wire all information at my expense.

JOHN T. FISHER, Sheriff
St. Anthony, Idaho
Clothing description comparison

Cairins Wanted Poster (1916)

finger, also tattoo of anchor same place on left hand; he wore a light colored hat, brown coat, red sweater, blue overalls over black trousers

Clark County John Doe NamUs Profile #UP13310

Clothing and Accessories

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Clothing</td>
<td>Dark colored pants, white shirt with blue pin stripes, maroon sweater - photos of clothing in IMAGES</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DNA Doe Project

http://www.DNADoeProject.org

http://www.facebook.com/DNADoeProject

For information on how to upload your DNA and opt in to law enforcement use:

http://help.forensicgenealogytraining.org